Literature Review: Organizing your Literature for Writing

Kealin McCabe
Research & Learning Services Librarian
Where we’ve been --- Searching

• Strategic Searching (Jan. 17th, 2019)
  • Efficient and Effective Searching
    • Selecting databases - Consulting the right resources
    • Mapping your research
    • Using controlled vocabulary
    • Using Boolean operators
    • Narrowing area of interest
Where we’ve been--- Organizing

• Citation Management (Jan. 22, 2019)
  • Importance of citing
  • Taking Notes
  • Exploring citation management programs
    • EndNote
    • Mendeley
    • Zotero
  • Organizing Literature / Assigning Tags & Keywords
Agenda

Literature Review

• What do you know about them?
• Why do you have to do one?
• Approaches to writing one
Literature Review

- Where have you encountered them?

Books & Book Chapters
Journal Articles
Review Articles
Theses
Dissertations
Government Reports

What do you know about them?
Do you feel prepared to write one?

What do you know about them?
Do you feel prepared to write one?

Doctoral students seeking advice on how to improve their literature reviews will find little published guidance worth heeding. . . . Most graduate students receive little or no formal training in how to analyze and synthesize the research literature in their field, and they are unlikely to find it elsewhere.

Have you written one before?

What do you know about them?
Have you written one before?

- What about your undergrad research papers?
Undergraduate Education

- Best preparation
- All were literature reviews

1. Pick / given general topic
2. Consult resources to create a discussion relating to your general topic.

What do you know about them?
Survey Courses

Focus of studies through the years

Seminar Courses

4th year thesis or project
Evolution of Research & Writing Skills

1st year 2nd year 3rd year 4th year
Evolution of Research & Writing Skills

- Understanding Assignments
- Finding appropriate materials
- Assessing materials
- Citing materials
- Short papers

What do you know about them?
Evolution of Research & Writing Skills

• Building on previous years
• Narrowing focus in course work
  number and type of sources
  improved reading skills
  ability to identify arguments / analyze
  to make connections between the readings

What do you know about them?
Evolution of Research & Writing Skills

Participation in seminar or research course
Independence
Full exploration of narrow topic
Extensive use of scholarship
Improved ability to read and integrate scholarship
Demonstrated ability to:
• Identify debates
• Themes
• Draw and justify conclusions based on scholarship

What do you know about them?
Evolution of Research & Writing Skills

1st year  2nd year  3rd year  4th year

Graduate Work

What do you know about them?
Undergraduate Education

• You are observing & reporting the conversation

What do you know about them?
Why do one?

Why do you have to do one?
Why is it important?

• Setting up your research

• Required
  • Proposal
  • Project, Thesis, Dissertation

• Justifying it

• Contextualizing it

Why do you have to do one?
What it tells the reader:

• Shows that you know what you are doing

• A good literature review will:
  • Tell the reader how your research will build upon and enhance the current body of research
  • Tell us what is known and what is unknown

Why do you have to do one?
The importance of reading

• The more you read the more prepared you are to be able to identify
  • Patterns
  • Debates
• Can shape and change the focus of your research
• Can shape how you will contribute
Each Piece

1. Summarize what each attempts to do. How was it constructed? What were the findings? The conclusions?

2. Annotate
   • Identify arguments: What did they argue? How did they argue it?

3. Evaluate the research / Did they meet objectives

4. Evaluate the evidence used

5. State what was good? what was bad?

6. Areas for future research

Approaches
Create a template

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Major Terms:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The author argues:</th>
<th>THEMES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Connections to other readings?</th>
<th>Method / Methodology</th>
<th>Major Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outstanding Questions</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example

• Internationalization of Education: themes
Why Internationalization?

- Power
- Politics
- Policy
- Privilege
Where I began...

What is it? Language that divides Economics

Approaches
“These concepts are often **mistakenly** used as interchangeable terms. *International* and *global* are two very different terms. The former refers to the relations between nations. The latter refers to the world or global as a whole, where the idea of nation-state is not pertinent. Therefore, when one adds the suffix *ization* to these terms, one gets very different meanings” (Knight, 2001, p. 229)
Trying to find a definition

- Globalization is a contested term
- Ambiguous
- Complex term
- Global people are privileged

“McDonaldization of the world” (Rizvi, 2000, p. 420).

Government push (Stier, 2004, p. 83)
Trying to find a definition

- Should not be seen as threat
- Need to see intermingling not competition or hierarchy
- IGO data

Approaches

- Leading to Homogeneity
- Cultural, Educational, and social
- Economic Gaps (Policy induced)
Language that Divides

Us
Developed
Dispense
Active
North
West
Established
Light
Have
Knowledge possession

Them
Developing
Receive
Passive
South
Rest
Becoming
Dark
Have Not
Knowledge Acquisition

Approaches
Language that divides

✗ Scholars’ analysis shows:
  ✓ Colonialism → Alive and well
  ✓ Hegemony
  ✓ Economic and social divides
  ✓ Orientalism → Fetishization, othering,
Erasure of Borders?

- Might see cross border migrations, but borders are still there, no demarcated lines, but they exist.
- Bordering and ordering (Robertson, 2011, 282)
- Classification | Borders within
- Research should look at how they are created and maintained | They create identities
Economics

- Education as big money
- Neoliberalism is pervasive
- Students are the consumers
- What we tend to see is $ | Hidden markets |
  - Transfer of capital happening on many levels | collaborative research | student travel

Approaches
Author argues that neoliberalism can be fought from within...

- Presents ways to resist it--- Arguing that increased diversity in student pop can battle it, but...
- (ME) when universities emphasize internationalization, which will technically bring cultural diversity, it doesn’t defeat neoliberalism because it is a tool of it!

Themes: Hierarchies

Maintaining Social Hierarchies

- Colonial Underpinnings
- “Benevolence”
- Infantilization
- Orientalism
- Exoticism (Women of the South)
- Other

Maintaining Economic Superiority

$ | FDI

- Knowledge Economy – increased participation = decreased gap
- globalize values, economic growth values imposed by governments and corporations --- enforced through educational institutions (Steir, 2004)
- Brain Gain
- Education is an open and “competitive” market
- Neoliberalism!
Maintaining Economic Superiority

Learning = Earning

What the state creates for you to follow becomes normalized, striving for “education” becomes a goal of freedom, not a tool of the state.

Maintaining Educational Hierarchy

- Lingua Franca
- Research Intensive Institutions $ (reinforcing hierarchy)
- Global Ranking Systems – One size fits all
- World Class / Excellence
- “From an ethnocentric neoliberal epistemology, the origin of poverty is a lack of valid knowledge or education (i.e., a universal capitalist epistemology) or entrepreneurship (hence the reference to “self-sufficiency”), factors which “developed” countries allegedly have in abundance” (de Andriotti et al, 2011, p. 128).
Themes

Approaches
# Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Year 1</th>
<th>Year 2</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Internationalization</td>
<td>Stein, de Andreotti, Bruce &amp; Susa (2016)</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 7 Andreotti (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic and social divides</td>
<td>Stein, de Andreotti, Bruce &amp; Susa (2016)</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 7 Andreotti (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benevolence social hierarchy</td>
<td>Stein, de Andreotti, Bruce &amp; Susa (2016)</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 7 Andreotti (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International initiative</td>
<td>Stein, de Andreotti, Bruce &amp; Susa (2016)</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 7 Andreotti (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNILA</td>
<td>Stein, de Andreotti, Bruce &amp; Susa (2016)</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 7 Andreotti (2011)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Resources to help you do that

• Excel
• OneNote
• Nvivo
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Have and the have nots/social mobility</td>
<td>Steiner, de Andreotti, Bruce &amp; Susa (2016)</td>
<td>Stier, J. (2004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural homogeneity</td>
<td></td>
<td>Wilson, K. (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homogeneity</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 7 Andreotti (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education as economy</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 7 Andreotti (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benevolence social hierarchy</td>
<td></td>
<td>Wilson, K. (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orientalism</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 7 Andreotti (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International initiative</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 7 Andreotti (2011)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Approaches

Globalization
Internationalization
Other/
economic and social divides
have and the have nots/social mobility
Cultural homogeneity
Homogeneity
Neoliberalism
Education as economy
Colonial underpinnings
Benevolence social hierarchy
Fetish
Infantilizing
Orientalism
International initiative
World Beyond
OECD
World Bank
UNILA
UNESCO
United Nations
### Approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISM</th>
<th>Government Docu...</th>
<th>Place and Space</th>
<th>Framework</th>
<th>TEMPLETES</th>
<th>To Read</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Anderson, R. C. (20...</td>
<td>Murray, C., Lombar...</td>
<td>Gabel, Susan L. &amp;...</td>
<td>Hannam-Swain, Ste...</td>
<td>Government of Can...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>UNITED NATIONS:...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Miskovic, M., &amp; Gab...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Rodriguez Martin, A...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Watson, N. 2002. “...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>OECD (2010)Sickne...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Accommodating Fa...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Campbell, F.K. (200...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Barnett, S. N., &amp; Al...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Newman, L., Wagne...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Williams, J. B. (201...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Morley, L., Walsh, V...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Anderson, R. C. (20...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Santuzzi, A. M., Wal...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gleeson, A. (20...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Reference


### Notes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GAP</th>
<th>Challenges of chronic illness in the academic work environment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Outside of NSF 2008 study, no data or study relating to disability of faculty (34)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Call by Elaine Berez in 2003 to have chronic illness recognized and acknowledge that it is impacting academics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AAUP clear policies regarding disability and tenure in a framework</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stigma</th>
<th>Can be unseen and reoccur/exhaustion impacts faculties (speech, thinking etc)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Author notes that institutions are generally very good at ensuring the needs of students with disabilities are met and monitored</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>This is important because they (students) will not experience this outside of school. Onus in the workplace is on the employee.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work place flexibility</th>
<th>Academics do have very flexible work conditions and as author notes “...unlike standards for performance...” (34) but the problem becomes that they work all of the time to ensure that everything is done</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Publish or perish</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Workplace pariah</th>
<th>Issues when no one knows how to talk to you, fear you, pity you, think your work is less than stellar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>To disclose or not disclose</th>
<th>Do not disclose because of judgements/pity/think there is something &quot;wrong&quot; with your mind.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disclosure</td>
<td>We all know that discrimination is wrong, but it still happens, not disclosing leaves you feeling safe/less ---------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As a whole

• Putting them all together
• When they are all put together, what does the field look like?
  • Points of convergence? Divergence?
• Identify the conversation
  • Whose research talks to whom?
  • What are the overarching themes? How are they connected?
  • Where are the gaps
NL in Higher Education

Hierarchies

Social

Cultural

Economic

Language

Colonial

Approaches
How many sources do I need?

- Hit saturation
- Repetition
NVivo

• What is it?
• How do access it?
• What can you do with it?
NVivo

• What is it?
• Qualitative Analysis tool
• Multiple projects
  • Literature Reviews
  • Interviews
NVivo

• How do access it?
User Profile

User Profile
This identifies any work you do in standalone NVivo projects

Name: mccabe.k
Initials: KM

User Interface Language

Language: English (United States)

Customer Experience Improvement Program

- [ ] Participate in the Customer Experience Improvement Program

Read more about the program

OK  Cancel
Saving your files

• They are not saved when you use VM Ware
• Save to your h://
NVivo

• What can you do with it?
  • Store documents and citations
  • Code documents and notes
  • Queries—
    • Word frequency in documents
    • Identify themes
    • Code books
References

